

**Hywel Dda University Health Board**

**A Healthier Mid and West Wales**

**Programme Business Case**

**Selection of Sites**

**Site Development Comparative Risks**

**July 2022**

## SUMMARY

No.	Risk Item	Site 7	Site 12	Site 17	Site C	Site J	Risk Context
01	Compliance with LA Development Plan Policies	15	3	3	3	25	Site J is considered the highest risk site due to its location being remote from St Clears town. Site 7 is considered a higher risk than sites 12, 17 and C due to the requirement to resolve the phosphates issue which does not exist on sites within Carms.
02	Planning Permission and Conditions	9	9	9	9	9	This is a low to medium risk and is considered the same for all sites. All sites will carry numerous but similar planning conditions.
03	Listed buildings and monuments in proximity	1	1	1	1	1	This is a very low risk and is considered the same for all sites.
04	Highways access onto site	9	3	3	9	9	Whilst this risk is not considered high, access onto sites 12 and 17 is considered to require an easier technical solution than the other sites.
05	Provision of secondary access	3	3	3	3	15	Site J is considered a higher risk than the other sites due to the limited frontage of the site boundary onto the A40 and no immediate and obvious secondary (emergency) access solution. There is no alternative route to access site J should a small section of A40 be blocked although this could be mitigated by the use of an active travel (cycle path) for essential blue light traffic.
06	Objections from Transport for Wales/SWTRA	9	9	9	9	9	This is a low to medium risk and is considered the same for all sites. There will be different issues to resolve with TfW and SWTRA on each site but all manageable.
07	SAB Consent	1	1	1	1	1	This is a low risk and is considered the same for all sites. All sites will require a sustainable drainage solution approved by SAB.

No.	Risk Item	Site 7	Site 12	Site 17	Site C	Site J	Risk Context
08	Biodiversity Net Gain Obligations	3	3	9	1	3	Risk assessed on site area. Site C is oversized and therefore presents the greatest opportunity for Biodiversity Net Gain whereas Site 17 is the smallest therefore presenting the highest challenge. All sites are capable of meeting requirements.
09	Requirement for land outside red line boundary	5	3	15	25	15	Site C is the highest risk as access onto the site is reliant on additional land. Site 17 is the smallest site and would benefit from additional land (currently being pursued) Site J whilst large enough would benefit from being able to acquire a parcel of land which currently creates an irregular site boundary.
10	Capability of site to accommodate future expansion	15	15	25	1	15	Risk assessed on site area. Site C is oversized and therefore presents the greatest opportunity for future expansion. Site 17 is the smallest site and would benefit from additional land (currently being pursued) All other sites can accommodate 20% future expansion but unlikely to accommodate more than this. Generally considered a medium risk as 20% expansion not fully defined.
11	Increased contribution to DCWW towards treatment of phosphates	15	3	3	3	3	Considered a low and manageable risk except for site 7 which currently would require specific technical design solutions or a contribution to DCWW/treatment works to resolve improve phosphate issues.
12	Requirement to purchase additional dwellings	1	1	1	1	1	This is a very low risk and is considered the same for all sites.
13	Existence of 'ransom' strips	1	25	1	1	1	This is a very low risk and is considered the same for all sites except on site 12 due to a known ransom strip.

No.	Risk Item	Site 7	Site 12	Site 17	Site C	Site J	Risk Context
14	Third party access rights across site	3	1	1	1	3	This is a very low and manageable risk and is generally considered the same for all sites although sites 7 and J have the potential for slightly more access rights.
15	Disposal of excavated material off site	9	9	9	1	3	Risk assessed on site area. Site C and J are of sufficient size presenting the opportunity to distribute excavated material across the undeveloped area of the site. Sites 7, 12 and 17 do not therefore excavated material would need to be removed from site.
16	Flood risk	1	1	1	1	3	Risk considered very low and manageable; site J has a marginally higher risk score due to access road currently shown as low risk of flooding in extreme weather events.
17	Diversions of existing utilities supplies	15	15	3	25	3	Sites 7, 12 and C all need services (overhead or underground) diverting. Sites j and 17 do not hence lower risk scores.
18	New utilities supplies and upgrades of existing	15	15	15	15	15	Risk considered medium for all sites on basis all sites require extensive works to provide new supplies which would be provided by utility providers therefore outside of the schemes direct control.
19	Public transport improvements	25	25	25	25	25	This is considered the highest risk to all sites. Public transport improvements to both infrastructure and frequency of services is essential to the successful operation of a new hospital.
20	Compensatory payments to residents	9	0	0	9	9	Risk is low to medium on sites 7, C and 7 and linked to land acquisition and property deals. Consideration to local residents also considered e.g. payments to properties along highway between site 7 and A40 due to increased traffic volumes.

No.	Risk Item	Site 7	Site 12	Site 17	Site C	Site J	Risk Context
21	St Clears train station not developed	0	0	5	0	3	Only a risk to sites 17 and J and considered low as TfW have committed funding for the project.
22	Signalisation of secondary access junction	0	0	3	0	0	Low risk and only applicable to site 17.
	<b>Total Score</b>	164	145	145	144	171	

## Risk

Score 1: Low Risk

Score 3: Manageable Risk

Score 5: Fundamental Risk

## Impact

Score 1: Limited Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 3: Material Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 5: Major Impact on Cost/Programme

## SITE 7

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
01	Compliance with LA Development Plan Policies	The site is not located within the current LDP area.	Discussions with Planning Authority do not suggest an issue.	3	5	15
02	Planning Permission and Conditions	Ability to obtain planning permission timeously	Include a Planning Performance Agreement at outset to discuss key issues	3	3	9
03	Listed buildings and monuments in proximity	Proximity to existing historic buildings in town centre may result in planning obligations	Buildings layout to minimise impact including screening	1	1	1
04	Highways access onto site	Ease of access onto the site	Early discussions with Highways authority	3	3	9
05	Provision of secondary /emergency access	Ability to provide a secondary/emergency access onto site for blue light vehicles	Emergency access only; controlled access	1	3	3
06	Objections from Transport for Wales/SWTRA	Impact of increased traffic journeys on local roads network	Issues of diverted trips from existing sites mitigating overall impact	3	3	9
07	SAB Consent	Necessity to obtain statutory SAB consent (disposal of surface water) before works can commence	Early engagement with SAB officer and submission of Pre-application	1	1	1
08	Biodiversity Net Gain Obligations	Requirement for developments to enhance biodiversity	Site area available will affect ease with which this can be achieved	1	3	3
09	Requirement for land outside red line boundary	Larger attenuation basins result in less developable area if off site connections not possible	Purchase of small tracts of land to enable connections into water courses	1	5	5
10	Capability of site to accommodate future expansion	Issues with topography and site area.	Larger site area offers more flexibility for future expansion	3	5	15
11	Increased contribution to DCWW towards treatment of phosphates	Control of phosphates in rivers required to be controlled in certain areas due to damaging environmental impact	Liaison with DCWW to confirm requirements and implications	3	5	15
12	Requirement to purchase additional dwellings	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Early discussions with property owners to understand their intentions	1	1	1

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
13	Existence of 'ransom' strips	Requirement to purchase land to facilitate access onto site	Early engagement with land owners	1	1	1
14	Third party access rights across site	DCWW right of way to pumping station	Early engagement with DCWW. Consideration of moving pumping station	3	1	3
15	Disposal of excavated material off site	Cost implications of removing excavated material off site	Site area available and topography will affect ease with which this can be achieved	3	3	9
16	Flood risk	Impact of flooding on site	Consider location of buildings and undertake necessary flood alleviation works	1	1	1
17	Diversions of existing utilities supplies	Major gas main diversion and programme implications	Engagement with Wales and West to plan and programme works	3	5	15
18	New utilities supplies and upgrades of existing	Upgrade of HV infrastructure and programme implications	Engagement with National Grid and/or Western Power to plan and programme works	3	5	15
19	Public transport improvements	Essential need to upgrade public transport connectivity to new hospital	WG and LA plans and investment required to improve services	5	5	25
20	Compensatory payments to residents	Local residents adversely affected due to additional traffic and noise	Engagement with affected local residents at early stage	3	3	9
	<b>Total Score</b>					164

### Risk

Score 1: Low Risk

Score 3: Manageable Risk

Score 5: Fundamental Risk

### Impact

Score 1: Limited Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 3: Material Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 5: Major Impact on Cost/Programme

## Site 12

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
01	Compliance with LA Development Plan Policies	The site is not located within the current LDP area.	Discussions with Planning Authority do not suggest an issue.	1	3	3
02	Planning Permission and Conditions	Ability to obtain planning permission timeously	Include a Planning Performance Agreement at outset to discuss key issues	3	3	9
03	Listed buildings and monuments in proximity	Proximity to existing historic buildings in town centre may result in planning obligations	Buildings layout to minimise impact including screening	1	1	1
04	Highways access onto site	Ease of access onto the site	Early discussions with Highways authority	1	3	3
05	Provision of secondary access	Ability to provide a secondary/emergency access onto site for blue light vehicles	Emergency access only; controlled access	1	3	3
06	Objections from Transport for Wales/SWTRA	Need to upgrade existing level crossing. Impact of increased traffic journeys on local roads network	Issues of diverted trips from existing sites mitigating overall impact	3	3	9
07	SAB Consent	Necessity to obtain statutory SAB consent (disposal of surface water) before works can commence	Early engagement with SAB officer and submission of Pre-application	1	1	1
08	Biodiversity Net Gain Obligations	Requirement for developments to enhance biodiversity. Site area available will affect ease with which this can be achieved	Site area available will affect ease with which this can be achieved	1	3	3
09	Requirement for land outside red line boundary	Multiple land owners. Larger attenuation basins result in less developable area if off site connections not possible	Purchase of small tracts of land to enable connections into water courses	1	3	3
10	Capability of site to accommodate future expansion	Issues with topography and site area.	Larger site area offers more flexibility for future expansion	3	5	15

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
11	Increased contribution to DCWW towards treatment of phosphates	Control of phosphates in rivers required to be controlled in certain areas due to damaging environmental impact	Liaison with DCWW to confirm requirements and implications	1	3	3
12	Requirement to purchase additional dwellings	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Early discussions with property owners to understand their intentions	1	1	1
13	Existence of 'ransom' strips	Requirement to purchase land to facilitate access onto site	Early engagement with land owners	5	5	25
14	Third party access rights across site	DCWW right of way to pumping station	Early engagement with DCWW. Consideration of moving pumping station	1	1	1
15	Disposal of excavated material off site	Cost implications of removing excavated material off site	Site area available and topography will affect ease with which this can be achieved	3	3	9
16	Flood risk	Impact of flooding on site	Consider location of buildings and undertake necessary flood alleviation works	1	1	1
17	Diversions of existing utilities supplies	Diversion of 132kv supplies not included in cost	Engagement with Wales and West to plan and programme works	3	5	15
18	New utilities supplies and upgrades of existing	Upgrade of HV infrastructure and programme implications	Engagement with National Grid and/or Western Power to plan and programme works	3	5	15
19	Public transport improvements	Essential need to upgrade public transport connectivity to new hospital	WG and LA plans and investment required to improve services	5	5	25
20	Compensatory payments to residents	Local residents adversely affected due to additional traffic and noise	Engagement with affected local residents at early stage	0	0	0
	<b>Total Score</b>					145

### Risk

Score 1: Low Risk

Score 3: Manageable Risk

Score 5: Fundamental Risk

### Impact

Score 1: Limited Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 3: Material Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 5: Major Impact on Cost/Programme

## Site 17

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
01	Compliance with LA Development Plan Policies	The site is not located within the current LDP area.	Discussions with Planning Authority do not suggest an issue.	1	3	3
02	Planning Permission and Conditions	Ability to obtain planning permission timeously	Include a Planning Performance Agreement at outset to discuss key issues	3	3	9
03	Listed buildings and monuments in proximity	Proximity to existing historic buildings in town centre may result in planning obligations	Buildings layout to minimise impact including screening	1	1	1
04	Highways access onto site	Access from A40; route over Highways land	Early discussions with Highways authority	1	3	3
05	Provision of secondary access	Requirement to obtain access via unadopted food court road	Emergency access only; controlled access	1	3	3
06	Objections from Transport for Wales/SWTRA	Impact of increased traffic journeys on local roads network	Issues of diverted trips from existing sites mitigating overall impact	3	3	9
07	SAB Consent	Necessity to obtain statutory SAB consent (disposal of surface water) before works can commence	Early engagement with SAB officer and submission of Pre-application	1	1	1
08	Biodiversity Net Gain Obligations	Requirement for developments to enhance biodiversity	Site area available will affect ease with which this can be achieved	3	3	9
09	Requirement for land outside red line boundary	Revised access route adjacent Food Retail into adjoining land; larger attenuation basins result in less developable area on restricted site	Purchase of small tracts of land to enable connections into water courses	3	5	15
10	Capability of site to accommodate future expansion	Issues with topography and site area.	Larger site area offers more flexibility for future expansion	5	5	25

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
11	Contribution to DCWW towards treatment of phosphates	Site not in SAC at present but potential for future inclusion	Liaison with DCWW to confirm requirements and implications	1	3	3
12	Requirement to purchase additional dwellings	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Early discussions with property owners to understand their intentions	1	1	1
13	Existence of 'ransom' strips	Requirement to purchase land to facilitate access onto site	Early engagement with land owners	1	1	1
14	Third party access rights across site	DCWW right of way to pumping station	Early engagement with DCWW. Consideration of moving pumping station	1	1	1
15	Disposal of excavated material off site	Cost implications of removing excavated material off site	Site area available and topography will affect ease with which this can be achieved	3	3	9
16	Flood risk	Impact of flooding on site	Consider location of buildings and undertake necessary flood alleviation works	1	1	1
17	Diversions of existing utilities supplies	Major gas main diversion and programme implications	Engagement with Wales and West to plan and programme works	3	1	3
18	New utilities supplies and upgrades of existing	Upgrade of HV infrastructure and programme implications	Engagement with National Grid and/or Western Power to plan and programme works	3	5	15
19	Public transport improvements	Essential need to upgrade public transport connectivity to new hospital	WG and LA plans and investment required to improve services	5	5	25
20	Compensatory payments to residents	Local residents adversely affected due to additional traffic and noise	Engagement with affected local residents at early stage	0	0	0
21	St Clears train station not developed	Site reasonable distance from station	WG committed funding	1	5	5
22	Signalisation of secondary access junction	Necessity to provide traffic signals at exit from site	Early engagement with Highway Authority	3	1	3
	<b>Total Score</b>					145

**Risk**

**Impact**

Score 1: Low Risk

Score 3: Manageable Risk

Score 5: Fundamental Risk

Score 1: Limited Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 3: Material Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 5: Major Impact on Cost/Programme

**Site C**

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
01	Compliance with LA Development Plan Policies	The site is not located within the current LDP area.	Discussions with Planning Authority do not suggest an issue.	1	3	3
02	Planning Permission and Conditions	Ability to obtain planning permission timeously	Include a Planning Performance Agreement at outset to discuss key issues	3	3	9
03	Listed buildings and monuments in proximity	Proximity to existing historic buildings in town centre may result in planning obligations	Buildings layout to minimise impact including screening	1	1	1
04	Highways access onto site	Ease of access onto the site	Early discussions with Highways authority	1	3	9
05	Provision of secondary access	Ability to provide a secondary/emergency access onto site for blue light vehicles	Emergency access only; controlled access	1	3	3
06	Objections from Transport for Wales/SWTRA	Need to upgrade existing level crossing. Impact of increased traffic journeys on local roads network	Issues of diverted trips from existing sites mitigating overall impact	3	3	9
07	SAB Consent	Necessity to obtain statutory SAB consent (disposal of surface water) before works can commence	Early engagement with SAB officer and submission of Pre-application	1	1	1
08	Biodiversity Net Gain Obligations	Requirement for developments to enhance biodiversity	Very large site provides greater opportunities to deliver requirements	1	1	1
09	Requirement for land outside red line boundary	Essential requirement to purchase two parcels of land to allow access	Purchase of small tracts of land to enable connections into water courses	5	5	25
10	Capability of site to accommodate future expansion	Control of phosphates in rivers required to be controlled in certain areas due to damaging environmental impact	Larger site area offers more flexibility for future expansion	1	1	1

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
11	Increased contribution to DCWW towards treatment of phosphates	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Liaison with DCWW to confirm requirements and implications	1	3	3
12	Requirement to purchase additional dwellings	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Early discussions with property owners to understand their intentions	1	1	1
13	Existence of 'ransom' strips	Requirement to purchase land to facilitate access onto site	Early engagement with land owners	1	1	1
14	Third party access rights across site	Small right of way at bottom of site	Early engagement with DCWW. Consideration of moving pumping station	1	1	1
15	Disposal of excavated material off site	Cost implications of removing excavated material off site	Site area available and topography will affect ease with which this can be achieved	1	1	1
16	Flood risk	Impact of flooding on site	Consider location of buildings and undertake necessary flood alleviation works	1	1	1
17	Diversions of existing utilities supplies	Major gas main diversion and programme implications	Engagement with Wales and West to plan and programme works	5	5	25
18	New utilities supplies and upgrades of existing	Upgrade of HV infrastructure and programme implications	Engagement with National Grid and/or Western Power to plan and programme works	3	5	15
19	Public transport improvements	Essential need to upgrade public transport connectivity to new hospital	WG and LA plans and investment required to improve services	5	5	25
20	Compensatory payments to residents	Local residents adversely affected due to additional traffic and noise	Engagement with affected local residents at early stage	3	3	9
	<b>Total Score</b>					144

### Risk

Score 1: Low Risk

Score 3: Manageable Risk

Score 5: Fundamental Risk

### Impact

Score 1: Limited Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 3: Material Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 5: Major Impact on Cost/Programme

## Site J

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
01	Compliance with LA Development Plan Policies	The site is not located within the current LDP area.	Discussions with Planning Authority do not suggest an issue.	5	5	25
02	Planning Permission and Conditions	Ability to obtain planning permission timeously	Include a Planning Performance Agreement at outset to discuss key issues	3	3	9
03	Listed buildings and monuments in proximity	Proximity to existing historic buildings in town centre may result in planning obligations	Buildings layout to minimise impact including screening	1	1	1
04	Highways access onto site	Ease of access onto the site	Early discussions with Highways authority	3	3	9
05	Provision of secondary access	Ability to provide a secondary/emergency access onto site for blue light vehicles	Emergency access only; controlled access	5	3	15
06	Objections from Transport for Wales/SWTRA	Impact of increased traffic journeys on local roads network	Issues of diverted trips from existing sites mitigating overall impact	3	3	9
07	SAB Consent	Necessity to obtain statutory SAB consent (disposal of surface water) before works can commence	Early engagement with SAB officer and submission of Pre-application	1	1	1
08	Biodiversity Net Gain Obligations	Requirement for developments to enhance biodiversity	Site area available will affect ease with which this can be achieved	1	3	3
09	Requirement for land outside red line boundary	Land required to widen active travel route adjacent A40 for emergency access	Additional land is preferable to optimise site development	3	5	15
10	Capability of site to accommodate future expansion	Control of phosphates in rivers required to be controlled in certain areas due to damaging environmental impact	Larger site area offers more flexibility for future expansion	3	5	15

No.	Risk Item	Description	Mitigation	Risk	Impact	Score
11	Increased contribution to DCWW towards treatment of phosphates	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Liaison with DCWW to confirm requirements and implications	1	3	3
12	Requirement to purchase additional dwellings	Land value includes properties within site boundary	Early discussions with property owners to understand their intentions	1	1	1
13	Existence of 'ransom' strips	Requirement to purchase land to facilitate access onto site	Early engagement with land owners	1	1	1
14	Third party access rights across site	Presence of rights of way across site	Early engagement with DCWW. Consideration of moving pumping station	3	1	3
15	Disposal of excavated material off site	Cost implications of removing excavated material off site	Site area available and topography will affect ease with which this can be achieved	1	3	3
16	Flood risk	Impact of flooding on site	Consider location of buildings and undertake necessary flood alleviation works	3	1	3
17	Diversions of existing utilities supplies	Major gas main diversion and programme implications	Engagement with Wales and West to plan and programme works	3	1	3
18	New utilities supplies and upgrades of existing	Upgrade of HV infrastructure and programme implications	Engagement with National Grid and/or Western Power to plan and programme works	3	5	15
19	Public transport improvements	Essential need to upgrade public transport connectivity to new hospital	WG and LA plans and investment required to improve services	5	5	25
20	Compensatory payments to residents	Local residents adversely affected due to additional traffic and noise	Engagement with affected local residents at early stage	3	3	9
21	St Clears train station not developed	Site considerable distance from station	WG committed funding	1	3	3
	<b>Total Score</b>					159

### Risk

Score 1: Low Risk

Score 3: Manageable Risk

### Impact

Score 1: Limited Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 3: Material Impact on Cost/Programme

Score 5: Fundamental Risk

Score 5: Major Impact on Cost/Programme